

MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE HELD 5 JANUARY 2023
at 7.00 pm

PRESENT: Councillors Mrs Carlyon, La Borde, Hall, Mrs Nolan, Nolan, Pascoe (Chairman), Sealy, Mrs Swain, and Wells

APOLOGIES: Apologies of absence were received from Councillors Ambler, Smith and Webb

Also in attendance: Adam Birchall, Chris Daly and Birgot Hontzsch, developers for Land North of A390, Threemilestone (PA22/07093); and Mr George Lewis, Architect and Mr Yiannis Pengas, owner, for 2 Strangways Villas (PA22/11012 & PA22/11013).

At the start of the meeting, the Chairman informed Members of the evacuation procedures.

254 DISCLOSURES OR DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

2 Strangways Villas (PA22/11012 & PA22/11013) (Minute 257, page 113)
Councillor Mrs Carlyon declared an interest in the above item as she is a neighbour.

255 INFORMAL PLANNING PRESENTATION

The developers for Land North of A390 gave a presentation on their application followed by a question-and-answer session. The application was considered under Schedule 2 below (Min 257, page 115 refers).

Councillor Wells informed Members he was trying to organise a meeting with South West Water and the Truro & Roseland Community Network Panel, to answer questions from parishes in the network area. He would include questions about foul drainage for the development proposals at Langarth in his correspondence and if a meeting could be secured, Members of the City Council would be invited to attend. The Committee also asked Mr Birchall if he could facilitate a meeting with the Environment Agency to address concerns relating to surface water run-off and potential flooding.

It was agreed more regular, informal discussions between the City Council and the developers would be useful as the applications progressed.

256 PLANNING MINUTES

The Minutes of the Planning Committee meeting held 1 December 2022 were considered for accuracy. It was proposed by Councillor La Borde, seconded by Councillor Mrs Carlyon and

RESOLVED the minutes of the Planning Committee meeting held 1 December 2022, with the above comments and corrections, were considered a correct record.

257 PLANNING CONSULTATION

(a) Schedule 1A

Further to all Councillors of Truro City Council being given the opportunity to submit comments to applications in their Ward (by an agreed deadline), and for Members of the Planning Committee to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the agenda for this meeting, it was proposed by Councillor Mrs Swain, seconded by Councillor Mrs Nolan, and that it be unanimously

RESOLVED that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1A, as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning Committee.

(b) Schedule 1B

The TCAAC recommendations for the February meeting cycle were as follows:

*(i) PA22/09484 – Truro Prep School, Treliske Lane
Deferral – with request to see again*

*(ii) PA22/09867 – WT Warren & Sons, Third Floor, 13 High Cross
Approval in principle – see comments*

*(iii) PA22/09945 & PA22/09946 – 8 River Street
Deferral – with request to see again*

*(iv) PA22/10278 – 1 Frances Street
Approval in principle – see comments*

*(v) PA22/10386 – The Market Butcher, Pannier Market, Back Quay
Approval in principle – see comments*

*(v) PA22/10455 – 5 Broad Street
Approval – no objections*

*(vi) PA22/11012 & PA22/11013 – 2 Strangways Villas
Refusal – objections*

Councillor Nolan wished for it to be noted that he did not agree with applications on Schedule B being moved to Schedule 2 for discussion at the meeting without notice. Brief discussion followed, with the Chairman pointing out the previous Planning Chairman had proposed the process in 2019, and though it had not been utilised very often, it had been available since then. It was agreed this would be looked at as part of the Change Programme in due course, and more appropriate processes proposed.

Further to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the agenda and at the meeting having heard the comments of the TCAAC, it was proposed by Councillor Mrs Carlyon, seconded by Councillor Mrs Swain, and that it be

RESOLVED that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1B, as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning Committee, with item 5 moved to Schedule 2 for discussion by the Committee, as per below.

Councillor Mrs Nolan wished for her name to be recorded as having voted against the above resolution.

(c) Schedule 2

The Committee considered plans submitted in accordance with the planning consultation procedure, details of which are attached (Schedule 2), and, that it be

RESOLVED that Cornwall Council be informed of the following recommendations as voted upon by Truro City Council's Planning Committee: -

(i) 2 Strangways Villas (4a&b)
(PA22/11012 & PA22/11013)

[N.B. This application was moved to the top of the schedule for discussion by the Chairman in order to allow the applicant to speak first. After the applicant spoke, and following the question-and-answer session, but prior to Councillor discussion and any proposal or vote, the Chairman suggested to Councillor Mrs Carlyon that as she had declared an interest in the application, she should leave the room. Councillor Mrs Carlyon queried the suggestion as she thought that a Councillor did not need to leave the room unless they had a pecuniary interest. Councillor Wells commented, as he had at a previous meeting, that Simon Mansell, Group Manager (Assurance) & Data Protection Officer Monitoring Officer at Cornwall Council, had informed him that Councillors should leave the room during the discussion and vote should they have declared any interest in an item, as this was in their best interest. However, as declarations of interest were the responsibility of individual Councillors, they could choose what to do with the advice.

Councillor Mrs Carlyon asked the Chairman for a copy of the legislation that stated this should be the case. The Chairman did not have this to hand but would email with the information the following day. Councillor Mrs Carlyon then left the room during the discussion and vote, and therefore did not vote on the recommendation.]

Approval recommended for the demolition and replacement of the existing 2 storey side extension and single storey rear extension, and the associated Listed Building Consent.

Proposer: Councillor Pascoe (Chairman)
Seconder: Councillor Sealy

Councillors Mrs Swain and La Borde wished for their names to be recorded as having voted against the above recommendation, and Councillor Nolan wished for his name to be recorded as having abstained.

Councillor Mrs Carlyon re-joined the meeting after the vote.

(ii) Land at Maiden Green, Off A390, Threemilestone (1)
(PA22/07181)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the Reserved Matters application on the grounds of the proposal being contrary to policies E4, E5, E6, and H3 (Langarth: provision of a district centre including a café, retail outlets etc. that now seemed to be missing from the plans but were present in the outline proposals) of the revised Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Development Plan.

Members also refused the application due to:

- 1) the lack of a stewardship management plan.
- 2) the lack of a biodiversity management plan.
- 3) concern over the building materials used, as details seemed to be missing from the documentation.
- 4) issues around the public open space.
- 5) no carbon accountability in the plans, for either the building of, or the life of, the development.
- 6) concerns around the access road, as well as the impact of transportation from the new development on the air quality where the Northern Access Road meets the A390 at the roundabout by the hospital, which would impact both Truro and Kenwyn parishes.
- 7) lack of clarity around the disposal of sewage which could have a significant impact on public health.
- 8) lack of satisfactory answer around issues of surface water run-off.

Proposer: Councillor La Borde
Secunder: Councillor Mrs Carlyon

(iii) **68 Daniell Road** (2)
(PA22/09493)

Refusal recommended on the grounds of the windows being too large which would lead to overlooking and lack of privacy.

Proposer: Councillor Nolan
Secunder: Councillor La Borde

(iv) **5 Broad Street** (3)
(PA22/10455)

Approval recommended for the construction of a single storey extension.

Proposer: Councillor Pascoe (Chairman)
Secunder: Councillor Wells

(v) **Land North of A390, Threemilestone** (5)
(PA22/07093)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the Reserved Matters application on the grounds of:

- 1) a lack of a traffic management plan, the access to the site, and issues regarding the car park (and the absence of a robust process to limit the driving to, and parking at the site in order to use the open space).
- 2) a lack of a management plan for the agricultural land.

The developers should refer to policy E5 of the Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Development Plan.

Proposer: Councillor Nolan
Secunder: Councillor Wells

(vi) **Truro Prep School, Treliske Lane** (5 from 1B)
(PA22/09484)

Approval recommended subject to the pipe being unobtrusive (not white) to match the existing façade.

Proposer: Councillor Mrs Carlyon
Secunder: Councillor Sealy

258 CORNWALL COUNCIL NOTICES

(Appendix 4)

(i) Five Day Notices

Members noted the report of five-day notices.

(ii) Premises Licence Applications

Members noted the report of premises licence applications.

259 CORRESPONDENCE

(i) Truro and Kenwyn Neighbourhood Development Plan Policies

Following an email from Councillor La Borde raising concerns that the Committee's recommendation on a previous recommendation (Old County Hall), the Chairman summarized a discussion they had, where it was agreed it would be a good idea for the Committee to discuss the interpretation of the TKNDP policies and how to apply them when considering planning applications. Mr Rob Lacey would be invited to the

meeting to advise.

(ii) Truro & Roseland Network Panel Proposal: Traffic Regulation Orders

Councillor Wells advised the consultation had been published today and the closing date was 26 January 2023. If Members had any comments, they were to submit them to the Chairman so he could submit them to the Network Panel.

(iii) National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) Consultation

Councillor Mrs Carlyon commented there was a further consultation for the NPPF which would close on the 12 March 2023, of which the Town Clerk had been informed. The item would be placed on the agenda for the next meeting for further discussion.

At the end of the meeting the Chairman reminded Members it was important to consider how they voiced objections to matters, both in person and in writing, and all communications within the City Council were subject to Freedom of Information requests.

The meeting closed at 9:12pm

Chairman

PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 5 JANUARY 2023

SCHEDULE 1A – To Receive a Single Recommendation for the Entire Schedule at the Meeting.

If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Thursday 22nd December at 5pm for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.

If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
(1) PA22/07181 Land at Maiden Green, off A390, Threemilestone	Reserved matters application for access for site outside of scope of the existing full consent, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale for 515 dwellings, 2no. community buildings and a primary school with public open space, landscaping and associated infrastructure (details following outline consent PA14/00703 dated 11.08.2016)	Gloweth Malabar and Shortlanesend	Schedule 2
(2) PA22/10256 The Pines, Malpas Road	Proposed extension and alteration.	Tregolls	Approval recommended
(3) PA22/09493 68 Daniell Road	Demolition of existing bungalow and construction of two residential dwellings without compliance with condition 2 of decision PA21/01468 dated 05.08.2021.	Boscawen and Redannick	Schedule 2
(4) PA22/09199 Land South of Rosewarne, Tregolls	Conversion/change of use of existing outbuilding to create a holiday let in the garden of 34 Tregolls Road	Tregolls	Approval recommended with the condition the conversion remains ancillary to the main dwelling and therefore cannot be sold separately.
(5) PA22/10431 32 Hillcrest Avenue	Single storey side extension	Boscawen and Redannick	Approval recommended
(6) PA22/10497 Little Home Parc, Comprigney Hill, Kenwyn	Works to tree subject to a TPO - removal of an Ash tree	Moresk and Trehaverne	Approval recommended
(7) PA22/10685 35 Upland Crescent	Replacement of rear balcony and additional of rear extension.	Tregolls	Approval recommended
(8) PA22/10895 16 Park View	Side extension to dwelling	Boscawen and Redannick	Approval recommended

(9) PA22/11064 31 Park View	Proposed loft conversion with new dormer, replacement rear extension and associated works.	Boscawen and Redannick	Approval recommended
(10) PA22/10286 66 St Clements Close	Loft Conversion to create additional bedroom	Tregolls	Approval recommended
(11) PA22/07093 Land North of A390, Threemilestone	Reserved Matters application following outline approval PA20/09631 for the 35.92Ha Governs Park, roads and parking area including SANG (Suitable Alternative Natural Greenspace) to include details of the access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale. The Outline Application was a EIA application and an ES was submitted to the Council at that time.	Threemilestone and Chacewater	Schedule 2

PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 5 JANUARY 2023
SCHEDULE 1B – APPLICATIONS WITHIN THE CONSERVATION AREA/LISTED BUILDING APPLICATIONS

These applications have been seen by ward members/Planning Committee within the month and therefore have recommendations (far right column). However, following recommendations from the Truro Conservation Area Advisory Committee, these applications may be revisited, upon request, at the Planning Committee meeting.

This schedule (minus any applications revisited at the meeting) will then receive a single ‘en-bloc’ recommendation as per Schedule 1A. If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Thursday 22nd December at 5pm

for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.

If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
(1) PA22/09867 WT Warren and Sons, Third Floor, 13 High Cross	Change of use from class E to sui generis for a tattoo studio	Moresk and Trehaverne	Approval recommended
(2) PA22/10386 The Market Butcher, Pannier Market	Proposed removal, provision and replacement of access doors to The Market Butchers and Pannier Market	Moresk and Trehaverne	Approval recommended
(3) PA22/10455 5 Broad Street	Construct a single storey glazed dining and kitchen extension without compliance with condition 2 of decision notice PA22/02449 dated 08/06/2022	Moresk and Trehaverne	Schedule 2
(4) PA22/10278 1 Frances Street	Listed building consent for change of use from a redundant hair salon (being a former dwelling) to a dwelling on the first floor, with existing access via Frances Street	Moresk and Trehaverne	Approval recommended
(5) PA22/09484 Truro Prep School, Treliske Lane	Listed building consent for improvements to weathering behind south gable roof. Addition of two downpipes with hoppers on south elevation to aid disposal of water and ease pressure on downpipes on west and east side.	Gloweth, Malabar and Shortlanesend	Approval recommended

<p>(6)(a) PA22/11012 2 Strangways Villas</p> <p>(b) PA22/11013 2 Strangways Villas</p>	<p>Demolition and replacement of the existing 2 storey side extension and single storey rear extension.</p> <p>Listed Building Consent for the above.</p>	<p>Boscawen and Redannick</p> <p>Boscawen and Redannick</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p> <p>Schedule 2</p>
<p>(7)(a) PA22/09945 8 River Street</p> <p>(b) PA22/09946 8 River Street</p>	<p>Alteration to existing shop frontage with re-instatement of existing pedestrian access & internal refurbishing works.</p> <p>Listed Building Consent for the above.</p>	<p>Moresk and Trehaverne</p> <p>Moresk and Trehaverne</p>	<p>Refusal recommended due to loss of the decorative stained glass.</p>

PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 5 JANUARY 2022
SCHEDULE 2 – Applications to be considered at the Meeting.

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
(1) PA22/07181 Land at Maiden Green, off A390, Threemilestone	Reserved matters application for access for site outside of scope of the existing full consent, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale for 515 dwellings, 2no. community buildings and a primary school with public open space, landscaping and associated infrastructure (details following outline consent PA14/00703 dated 11.08.2016)	Gloweth, Malabar and Shortlanesend	
(2) PA22/09493 68 Daniell Road	Demolition of existing bungalow and construction of two residential dwellings without compliance with condition 2 of decision PA21/01468 dated 05.08.2021.	Boscawen and Redannick	
(3) PA22/10455 5 Broad Street	Construct a single storey glazed dining and kitchen extension without compliance with condition 2 of decision notice PA22/02449 dated 08/06/2022	Moresk and Trehaverne	
(4)(a) PA22/11012 2 Strangways Villas (b) PA22/11013 2 Strangways Villas	Demolition and replacement of the existing 2 storey side extension and single storey rear extension. Listed Building Consent for the above.	Boscawen and Redannick Boscawen and Redannick	
(5) PA22/07093 Land North of A390, Threemilestone	Reserved Matters application following outline approval PA20/09631 for the 35.92Ha Governs Park, roads and parking area including SANG (Suitable Alternative Natural Greenspace) to include details of the access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale. The Outline Application was a EIA application and an ES was submitted to the Council at that time.	Threemilestone & Chacewater	

Five Day Notices

Planning Application	Truro City Council Comments	Case Officer Comments	Outcome
<p>PA22/09856 and PA22/09857 Mount Charles House, Infirmary Hill</p>	<p>Unanimous approval recommended for the planning application and associated Listed Building Consent application.</p>	<p>Officer support is not forthcoming for the scheme, unless the comments of the conservation officer are overcome, to ensure that there is less than substantial harm to the listed building. HIA lacks clear or robust justification for the proposed works. In addition, there is little information regarding the significance of the proposed loss of historic fabric.</p>	<p>Agree</p>
<p>PA22/09965 and PA22/10112 45 Lemon Street</p>	<p>Unanimous approval for the redevelopment and the associated Listed Building Consent, subject to appropriate materials that comply with Conservation Area policies (such as hand painted timber or aluminium) being used, and subject to no sustainable planning objections from the neighbours.</p>	<p>Having accessed the information provided the proposed works are not considered acceptable. This is due to works being assessed as overdevelopment in heritage terms of an existing garage at the rear of a grade II listed property.</p> <p>Specifically, the proposed works are considered to harm the setting of the listed building due to the inappropriate use of materials such as UPVc, design and mass, which not only detracts from the setting of heritage asset but the conservation area as a whole.</p>	<p>Agree</p>

		<p>Considering the above, the proposals in their current form would cause harm to the setting of the listed building due to the introduction of inappropriate development and would also fail to preserve or enhance the designated conservation area.</p>	
<p>PA22/06920 and PA22/06919 South Penarth</p>	<p>Refusal recommended for the proposed conversion and extension and associated listed building consent due to the loss of trees, the proposal constituting overdevelopment, and the design being inappropriate for within the curtilage of a Listed Building and the adjacent barn.</p>	<p>The agent has provided another revision, that includes a glazed link, between the existing building and the extension. The extension still is on the same footprint as originally proposed that projects forward of the building line of the existing, to create an Lshape and it has a flat sedum roof.</p> <p>I am still minded to refuse the application.</p>	<p>Refusal</p>

Premises Licence Applications

Licensing Application	Type of application	Truro City Council comments
O Yes Pizzeria & Grill 5 Quay Street	Variation - add off and online sales	Approval recommended