

**MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE HELD 2 FEBRUARY 2023**  
**at 7.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** Councillors Mrs Carlyon, La Borde, Mrs Nolan, Nolan, Pascoe (Chairman), Mrs Swain, Walker-Sunderhauf, Webb and Wells

**APOLOGIES:** An apology of absence was received from Councillors Ambler, Hall, Sealy and Smith

Also in attendance: John Marshall, agent for Land Adjacent to Hangman's Cottage, Hamilton Close (PA22/11019);  
Mr David Rabey, applicant and member of the Truro Community Hub Project Steering Group and a trustee of Truro Methodist Church (PA22/10849), and Matthew Small, neighbour of Truro Methodist Church.  
Several members of the public.

At the start of the meeting, the Chairman informed Members of the evacuation procedures.

**295 DISCLOSURES OR DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**1 Strangways Villas** (PA22/10751 & PA22/10752) (Minute 297(c)(iii), page 138)  
Councillor Mrs Carlyon declared an interest in the above item as she is a neighbour.

**10 The Parade, Malpas Road** (PA23/00425 & PA23/00426) (Minute 297(b), page 137)  
Councillors Nolan and Mrs Nolan declared an interest in the above item as this was a former property. However, this item was not discussed at the meeting.

**296 PLANNING MINUTES**

The Minutes of the Planning Committee meeting held 5 January 2023 were considered for accuracy. Councillor Mrs Carlyon apologised for having given the incorrect date for the deadline for comments for the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) Consultation (Correspondence, Minute 259(iii), page 116), and confirmed the closing date was 2 March 2023.

It was proposed by Councillor Webb (Mayor), seconded by Councillor Mrs Swain, and unanimously

**RESOLVED** the minutes of the Planning Committee meeting held 5 January 2023, with the above comments and corrections, were considered a correct record.

**297 PLANNING CONSULTATION**

**(a) Schedule 1A**

Further to all Councillors of Truro City Council being given the opportunity to submit comments to applications in their Ward (by an agreed deadline), and for Members of the Planning Committee to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the agenda for this meeting, it was proposed by Councillor Webb (Mayor), seconded by Councillor Mrs Swain, and that it be

**RESOLVED** that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1A, as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning Committee.

Councillor Nolan wished for his name to be recorded as having abstained from voting on the above resolution.

**(b) Schedule 1B**

The TCAAC recommendations for the February meeting cycle were as follows:

*(i) PA22/10495 – The Carriage House, Infirmary Hill.*

*Refusal (see comments). A suitable resubmission would be welcome.*

*(ii) PA22/10751 & PA22/10752 – 1 Strangways Villas*

*Approval, no objection. See comments.*

*(iii) PA22/10849 – Methodist Church, Union Place*

*Approval, no objections.*

*(iv) PA22/11265 – Truro Courts of Justice, Edward Street*

*Approval in principle – see comments*

*(v) PA22/11298 – Truro Foyer*

*Approval – subject to comments*

*(v) PA22/11358 – Flat 2, St George's Road*

*Approval in principle – see comments*

*(vi) PA23/00320 – 19-20 King Street (Clarks Shoes)*

*Deferral – see comments. A suitable resubmission would be welcome.*

*(vii) PA23/00425 & PA22/00426 – 10 The Parade, Malpas Road*

*Approval, see comments.*

Further to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the agenda and at the meeting having heard the comments of the TCAAC, it was proposed by Councillor Mrs Carlyon, seconded by Councillor Webb (the Mayor), that it be

**RESOLVED** that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1B, as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning Committee, with items 3 & 7 moved to Schedule 2 for discussion by the Committee, as per below.

Councillors Nolan and Mrs Nolan wished for their names to be recorded as having voted against the above resolution.

**(c) Schedule 2**

The Committee considered plans submitted in accordance with the planning consultation procedure, details of which are attached (Schedule 2), and, that it be

**RESOLVED** that Cornwall Council be informed of the following recommendations as voted upon by Truro City Council's Planning Committee: -

**(i) Land Adjacent to Hangman's Cottage, Hamilton Close (4)**

**(PA22/11019)**

Approval recommended for the Technical Details Consent.

Proposer: Councillor Webb (Mayor)

Seconder: Councillor Mrs Swain (Deputy Mayor)

Councillor Mrs Carlyon wished for her name to be recorded as having abstained from voting on the above recommendation.

**(ii) Methodist Church, Union Place (3)**  
(PA22/10849)

Unanimous deferral recommended, as though in principle Members supported the creation of the community hub due to the need for community space in the City Centre, they considered it important for the applicant to investigate the impact of the back extension on the neighbours due to the significant concerns raised.

These concerns related to, but were not limited to, potential overshadowing of gardens resulting in loss of light, potential noise disturbances, visual impact, and the design, which was not felt to be sympathetic to its surroundings or the church. Members requested the applicant reports back to the next meeting of the Planning Committee following consultation with the neighbours, recognising the extensive work that had gone into the designs to date, and the timeline due to the Towns Fund Deal funding.

Proposer: Councillor Mrs Nolan  
Secunder: Councillor Mrs Swain

**(iii) 1 Strangways Villas (1&2)**  
(PA22/10751 & PA22/10752)

Approval recommended for the garden room and associated works.

Proposer: Councillor Webb (Mayor)  
Secunder: Councillor Mrs Swain

Councillor Mrs Carlyon, having declared an interest in the above application, left the room during the discussion and did not vote on the recommendation.

**(iv) Kelsey, City Road (5)**  
(PA22/11118)

Refusal recommended for the demolition of the existing dwelling house and creation of ten new apartments on the grounds of overlooking of Chy Barham from the windows at the back of the apartments, and the lack of aesthetic appeal of the design (See Chapter 6, 'Asking for Beauty', of the proposed revisions to the National Planning Policy Framework – Gove, December 2022).

**(v) 20 Penair Crescent (6)**  
(PA23/00043)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the proposed single storey extension due to inaccuracies of the application (there are several trees on the property that would be significantly impacted) and the proposal constituting overdevelopment.

Proposer: Councillor Webb (Mayor)  
Secunder: Councillor Pascoe (Chairman)

The following applications were moved from Schedule 1B as per Minute 297(b), page 137, above.

**(vii) The Carriage House, Infirmary Hill (3 on 1B)**  
(PA22/10495)

Unanimous approval recommended for the installation of solar panels in principle, though Members would prefer the use of conservation area-specific panels that would lie flush with the roof.

Proposer: Councillor Webb (Mayor)  
Secunder: Councillor Mrs Nolan

(vi) **19 – 20 King Street (Clark’s Shoes)** (7 on 1B)  
(PA23/00320)

Unanimous approval recommended for the Listed Building Consent subject to the size and distribution of the windowpanes matching the existing.

**298 CORNWALL COUNCIL NOTICES**

*(Appendix 4)*

**(i) Five Day Notices**

Members noted the report of five-day notices.

**(ii) Premises Licence Applications**

Members noted the report of premises licence applications.

**299 TRURO TRANSPORT STRATEGY WORKING GROUP**

**(i) Terms of Reference**

It was proposed by Councillor Webb (Mayor), seconded by Councillor Mrs Swain and

**RECOMMENDED** to Council that the Terms of Reference for the Truro Transport Strategy Working Group be approved as amended.

**(ii) Standing Item for Updates/Discussion**

The Chairman informed Members the Standing item would appear on each Planning Committee agenda in order for Members to discuss anything arising from the Working Group. Members briefly discussed the decision from the Working Group that the minutes from the meetings were to be confidential. Members felt that it was important that discussions were recorded openly for public record and reiterated that the purpose of minutes was not to include every detail of discussion but to accurately record decisions taken.

Therefore, it was proposed by Councillor Pascoe (Chairman), seconded by Councillor Mrs Swain and

**RECOMMENDED** that the Truro Transport Working Group reconsiders the process of the meeting and the creation of the minutes as the Planning Committee strongly felt these should not be confidential. The minutes should also be submitted to the Planning Committee each month for consideration as part of the Standing Item for discussion.

**300 TRAFFIC REGULATION ORDERS**

Members discussed the estimated cost for the Traffic Regulation Orders that had been submitted to Cornwall Council, which was significantly higher than expected.

Following discussion around the City Council’s Precept, which had just recently been resolved at Council (30.01.2023), and whether there were any available funds, it was proposed by Councillor Pascoe (Chairman), seconded by Councillor Nolan and unanimously

**RECOMMENDED** that:

- (i) the Town Clerk inform the Planning Committee as to whether there were any available funds to cover the predicted costs;
- (ii) the Chairman, working with Councillors Wells, Nolan and Rich as the local members who were also Truro City Councillors, contact Viv Bidgood, Cornwall Council, regarding the quote given, to seek justification of the cost and to explain the City Council wished to

submit one Traffic Regulation Order (TRO) application that covered the multiple sites listed.

**301 NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK (NPPF) CONSULTATION**

Further to Minute 259(iii), page 116, 05.01.2023), the Chairman asked Members to review the amended NPPF documents and submit any comments to him and the Planning Clerks within fourteen days (17 February 2023) so he could collate them and forward them as a singular response from the City Council.

**302 CHAIRMAN'S REPORT**

There was nothing to report.

**303 CORRESPONDENCE**

Correspondence that had been sent to the City Council regarding planning matters had been added as agenda items as per the minutes above.

The meeting closed at 8:41pm

-----  
Chairman

# Schedule 1A

## PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 2 FEBRUARY 2023

### SCHEDULE 1A – To Receive a Single Recommendation for the Entire Schedule at the Meeting.

*If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Thursday 26<sup>th</sup> January at 5pm for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.*

*If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.*

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
<b>(1) PA22/11019 Land Adjacent to Hangmans Cottage, Hamilton Close</b>	Application for Technical Details Consent in relation to Permission in Principle PA22/00708 for the construction of six new dwellings and associated works	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	Schedule 2
<b>(2) PA22/11361 Street Record, Cathedral View</b>	Application for tree works within a TPO Area: 1 x Sycamore to prune to clear lights and crown reduction and 1 x Ash remove all deadwood	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	Approval recommended
<b>(3) PA23/00043 20 Penair Crescent</b>	Proposed single storey extension	<b>Tregolls</b>	Schedule 2
<b>(4) PA23/00075 The Cedars, Park View</b>	Application for tree works in a Tree Preservation Order: Reduction of the lower limbs and internal large dead wood to be removed to a Monterey Cypress tree	<b>Boscawen and Redannick</b>	Approval recommended
<b>(5) PA23/0018 11 Cotsland Road</b>	Works to trees under a tree-preservation order (TPO) namely: T1 - Sycamore - remove to basal dysfunction of approx 50 stem circumference. Replace with a Quercus robur Koster.	<b>Tregolls</b>	Approval recommended
<b>(6) PA23/10770 10 Trewinnard Grove</b>	Works to trees subject to a TPO: T1- Fraxinus excelsior. Suffering from Ash Dieback. Fell to ground. T2- Fraxinus excelsior. Suffering from Ash Dieback. Fell to ground	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	Approval recommended

# Schedule 1A

<b>(7) PA23/00055</b> <b>1 Hendra Vean</b>	Proposed single storey extension to rear	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	Approval recommended
<b>(8) PA23/00184</b> <b>81 Tinney Drive</b>	Works to trees subject to a Tree Preservation Order (TPO), works include T1 remove lowest limb and thin out crown by 10%. T2 remove lowest limb to encourage growth of smaller plant. T3 remove lowest limb to encourage growth of smaller adjacent tree	<b>Tregolls</b>	Approval recommended
<b>(9) PA22/11118</b> <b>Kelsey, City Road</b>	Demolition of existing single dwelling house and replace with 10 new apartments with associated, access, parking and amenity without compliance of condition 2 in relation decision notice PA19/07927 dated 12/12/2019	<b>Boscawen and Redannick</b>	Schedule 2
<b>(10) PA22/11406</b> <b>18 Woodland Court</b>	Application for tree works in a Tree Preservation Order to include: Crown reduction of a mature large Yew tree	<b>Morsk and Trehaverne</b>	Approval recommended

# Schedule 1B

## PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 2 FEBRUARY 2023

### SCHEDULE 1B – APPLICATIONS WITHIN THE CONSERVATION AREA/LISTED BUILDING APPLICATIONS

*These applications have been seen by ward members/Planning Committee within the month and therefore have recommendations (far right column). However, following recommendations from the Truro Conservation Area Advisory Committee, these applications may be revisited, upon request, at the Planning Committee meeting.*

*This schedule (minus any applications revisited at the meeting) will then receive a single ‘en-bloc’ recommendation as per Schedule 1A. If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Thursday 26<sup>th</sup> January at 5pm for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.*

*If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.*

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
(1)(a) PA22/10751 1 Strangways Villas	Provision of a garden room and provision of conservation roof lights to the rear of the ground floor pitched roof	<b>Boscawen and Redannick</b>	Schedule 2
(b) PA22/10752 1 Strangways Villas	Listed Building Consent for the above	<b>Boscawen and Redannick</b>	
(2) PA22/10849 Methodist Church, Union Place	Creation of Truro Community Hub, comprising of the demolition of 20th Century single storey extension to, and minor demolition and refurbishment of, former Wesleyan School. New extension to former Wesleyan School, and associated minor alterations to Truro Methodist Church, all with associated external works including new terraces, entrance ramp, alterations to car park and soft landscaping.	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	Schedule 2
(3) PA22/10495 The Carriage House, Infirmary Hill	Installation of black solar panels on roof	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	Approval recommended
(4) PA22/11298 Truro Foyer, Lander Court	Works to trees subject to a tree preservation order - We would like this tree to be dismantled to ground level. The tree is not likely to regrow, so we have proposed mitigation planting.	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	Approval recommended

# Schedule 1B

<p><b>(5) PA22/11265</b>  <b>Truro Courts of Justice, Edward Street</b></p>	<p>Listed Building Consent:- Replacement of the existing mechanical heating, cooling and ventilation equipment with new. Internally air handling units and VRF systems will be replaced, with new pipework and ductwork installed. Externally, the smaller condenser units will be removed and new air handling units placed in the location of the existing air handling units. Two of the air handling units will be moved internally to reduce the impact on aesthetic significance. Repairs internally will use plasterboard, scrim and paint in colours to match the existing. Externally, a liquid roofing system will be used to repair the roof (like for like).</p>	<p><b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b></p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p><b>(6) PA22/11358</b>  <b>Flat 2, 14 St Georges Road</b></p>	<p>Listed Building Consent: Retrospective: Internal alterations/ renovations</p>	<p><b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b></p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p><b>(7) PA23/00320</b>  <b>19-20 King Street</b></p>	<p>Listed Building Consent for the replacement of steel windows to south and west elevations to aluminium</p>	<p><b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b></p>	<p>Approval recommended</p>
<p><b>(8)(a) PA23/00425</b>  <b>10 The Parade, Malpas Road</b></p> <p><b>(b) PA23/00426</b>  <b>10 The Parade, Malpas Road</b></p>	<p>Proposed refurbishment and alterations to grade II listed building including change of use of part B'n'B to residential dwelling.</p> <p>Listed Building Consent for the above</p>	<p><b>Tregolls</b></p> <p><b>Tregolls</b></p>	<p>Approval recommended</p> <p>Approval recommended</p>

# Schedule 2

**PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 2 FEBRUARY 2023**  
**SCHEDULE 2 – Applications to be considered at the Meeting.**

<b>Application Details</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>Ward</b>	<b>Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman &amp; Councillors</b>
<b>(1) (a) PA22/10751</b> <b>1 Strangways Villas</b>  <b>(b) PA22/10752</b> <b>1 Strangways Villas</b>	Provision of a garden room and provision of conservation roof lights to the rear of the ground floor pitched roof  Listed Building Consent for the above	<b>Boscawen and Redannick</b>  <b>Boscawen and Redannick</b>	
<b>(2) PA22/10849</b> <b>Methodist Church, Union Place</b>	Creation of Truro Community Hub, comprising of the demolition of 20th Century single storey extension to, and minor demolition and refurbishment of, former Wesleyan School. New extension to former Wesleyan School, and associated minor alterations to Truro Methodist Church, all with associated external works including new terraces, entrance ramp, alterations to car park and soft landscaping.	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	
<b>(3) PA22/11019</b> <b>Land Adjacent to Hangmans Cottage, Hamilton Close</b>	Application for Technical Details Consent in relation to Permission in Principle PA22/00708 for the construction of six new dwellings and associated works	<b>Moresk and Trehaverne</b>	
<b>(4) PA22/11118</b> <b>Kelsey, City Road</b>	Demolition of existing single dwelling house and replace with 10 new apartments with associated, access, parking and amenity without compliance of condition 2 in relation decision notice PA19/07927 dated 12/12/2019	<b>Boscawen and Redannick</b>	
<b>(5) PA23/00043</b> <b>20 Penair Crescent</b>	Proposed single storey extension	<b>Tregolls</b>	

### Five Day Notices

Planning Application	Truro City Council Comments	Case Officer Comments	Outcome
<p><b>PA22/09856 and PA22/09857 Mount Charles House, Infirmary Hill</b></p>	<p>Unanimous approval recommended for the planning application and associated Listed Building Consent application.</p>	<p>Officer support is not forthcoming for the scheme, unless the comments of the conservation officer are overcome, to ensure that there is less than substantial harm to the listed building. HIA lacks clear or robust justification for the proposed works. In addition, there is little information regarding the significance of the proposed loss of historic fabric.</p>	<p>Agree</p>
<p><b>PA22/09965 and PA22/10112 45 Lemon Street</b></p>	<p>Unanimous approval for the redevelopment and the associated Listed Building Consent, subject to appropriate materials that comply with Conservation Area policies (such as hand painted timber or aluminium) being used, and subject to no sustainable planning objections from the neighbours.</p>	<p>Having accessed the information provided the proposed works are not considered acceptable. This is due to works being assessed as overdevelopment in heritage terms of an existing garage at the rear of a grade II listed property.</p> <p>Specifically, the proposed works are considered to harm the setting of the listed building due to the inappropriate use of materials such as UPVc, design and mass, which not only detracts from the setting of heritage asset but the conservation area as a whole.</p>	<p>Agree</p>

		<p>Considering the above, the proposals in their current form would cause harm to the setting of the listed building due to the introduction of inappropriate development and would also fail to preserve or enhance the designated conservation area.</p>	
<p><b>PA22/06920 and PA22/06919 South Penarth</b></p>	<p>Refusal recommended for the proposed conversion and extension and associated listed building consent due to the loss of trees, the proposal constituting overdevelopment, and the design being inappropriate for within the curtilage of a Listed Building and the adjacent barn.</p>	<p>The agent has provided another revision, that includes a glazed link, between the existing building and the extension. The extension still is on the same footprint as originally proposed that projects forward of the building line of the existing, to create an Lshape and it has a flat sedum roof.</p> <p>I am still minded to refuse the application.</p>	<p>Refusal</p>
<p><b>PA22/09199 Land South West of Rosewarne, Tregolls Road</b></p>	<p>Approval recommended with the condition the conversion remains ancillary to the main dwelling and therefore cannot be sold separately.</p>	<p>The application is for a holiday let not an annexe as such we would not condition ancillary use as this will be independent use of the main dwelling. A holiday use condition would be imposed to ensure that this is not used as an independent dwelling.</p> <p>It has however been considered reasonable that the holiday let and no.34 are maintained as one</p>	<p>Agree</p>

		<p>planning unit at this time noting the lack of amenity serving no.34 if split off and the current shared parking arrangement as such this would form a condition accordingly.</p> <p>In light of the above, I intend to recommend the application for approval.</p>	
--	--	---	--

### Premises Licence Applications

<b>Licensing Application</b>	<b>Type of application</b>	<b>Truro City Council comments</b>
Bunters, 58 Little Castle Street	Review Ref :Public Nuisance	No objection subject to added conditions of the application (and any laws) being adhered to.
Mediterraneo 18 Victoria Square	On and Off Sales/Supply of alcohol	No objection