

**MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE HELD THURSDAY 2 JANUARY 2020  
at 7.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** Councillors Biscoe, Mrs Carlyon, Pascoe, Ms Southcombe, Mrs Swain, Vella, (Chairman) Webb and Wells

**APOLOGIES:** Apologies for absence were reported from Councillors Biscoe, Ellis and Tamblyn

Also in attendance: Councillor Rich,  
Mr Martin Wilkins (member of the public, against), and Mr John Marshall (Planning Consultant for the developer, for) (60 Tregolls Road, PA19/10271).  
There were also half a dozen members of the public (not speaking) in attendance to listen to the above application.

**287 DISCLOSURES OR DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

(PA19/10352) **79 Lemon Street** (Minute 289 (b) (8), page 168)

Councillor Mrs Carlyon declared an interest due to Mr Carlyon being the freeholder of 78 Lemon Street.

(PA19/10512) **Cemetery, Kenwyn** (Minute 289 (a), page 166)

Councillor Wells declared an interest due to being the Vice-Chairman on the Trustees Board for the Parochial Church Council of the Ecclesiastical Parish of Kenwyn with St Allen.

**288 MINUTES**

The Minutes of the meeting held 5 December 2019, were read and considered a correct record.

**289 PLANNING CONSULTATION**

**(a) Schedule 1**

Further to all Councillors of Truro City Council being given the opportunity to submit comments to applications in their Ward (by an agreed deadline), and for Members of the Planning Committee to comment on this Schedule prior to publication of the agenda for this meeting, it was proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) that it be unanimously

**RESOLVED** that the recommendations contained within Schedule 1, as proposed by the Chairman, be adopted by the Planning Committee.

**(b) Schedule 2**

The Committee considered plans submitted in accordance with the planning consultation procedure, details of which are attached (Schedule 2), and, that it be

**RESOLVED** that Cornwall Council be informed of the following recommendations as voted upon by Truro City Council's Planning Committee: -

**(i) 60 Tregolls Road (1)**

(PA19/10271)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the Outline application with some matters reserved on the grounds of:

(i) overdevelopment of the site. The proposal does not respect the existing street-scene, fundamentally altering the appearance of the estate and therefore public perception of this part of Truro;

(ii) the loss of green space (with little potential of any green space being added due to the exclusion zone around the sewer);

- (iii) lack of consideration to the existing Highway. Turning space, and provision for deliveries would need to be provided for new dwellings;
- (iv) the site being a high flood risk due to being in a critical drainage area. The topography, along with the proposed addition of hard surfacing, would add to the surface water run-off. A detailed analysis of the water run-off as existing would be helpful;
- (v) failing to create a design that respects the context of the local area (including use of existing local materials such as that from the proposed demolition of the barns);
- (vi) the proposal being contrary to the principles of the original development;
- (vii) concerns over land ownership, over the wall entrance (the removal of one side would render the purpose—that of a feature—useless), and the removal of trees prior to any works being approved (a re-planting scheme seems to be omitted from the proposal).

Members invite the applicant to come back with a scheme that respects the local area, understands that quality of life for residents is important, and addresses the City Council's previous concerns surrounding climate change and air pollution.

Proposer: Councillor Vella

Following the recommendation, Councillor Rich, the speakers, and all members of the public left the meeting at 7:35pm.

**(ii) Land at Tolgarrick (2)**  
(PA19/04786)

Unanimous refusal recommended for the reserved matters application on the grounds of:

- (i) inadequate play area provision, within a suitable distance from the dwellings, and inadequate public open space (the 4-metre strip along the bottom of the site is not considered to be public open space);
- (ii) overcrowding, due to the dwellings being crammed into this phase of the development (due to lack of affordable housing being provided in the first), which Members consider provides an inadequate quality of life;
- (iii) ongoing concern over the management of foul drainage and surface water run-off on site;
- (iv) lack of storage space for bins and recycling as efficiency of design is vital;
- (v) concerns of modern life not being considered, such as measures to mitigate climate change, and there being no provision for a community centre

Members also wondered whether the management company, which is cited as being responsible for maintenance on site, has been set up.

The Committee is sympathetic to the need for affordable housing but not at the compromise of quality of life and feel the Design Review Panel provided comments that gave strong grounds for refusal of this application. Members invite the applicant to come back with a scheme that addresses the above concerns, as well as those outlined in previous comments from the City Council.

Proposer: Councillor Vella

**(iii) Land Adjacent to Lamorran, Old Falmouth Road (3)**  
(PA19/09402)

Councillor Smith left the room at 7:55pm and returned at 8:00pm.

Approval recommended for the demolition of three existing buildings and replacement with a single storey sustainable dwelling on the condition of adequate mitigation to prevent excess surface water run-off from the site. In addition, any new hard surface should be permeable, and any topsoil removed during excavation should be retained for use on site.

Proposer: Councillor Wells  
Seconder: Councillor Vella

Councillor Mrs Carlyon wished for her name to be recorded as voting against the above recommendation.

(iv) **Land to the North of Lamorran, Old Falmouth Road (4)**  
(PA19/09403)

Unanimous refusal for the construction of two infill single storey dwellings, in line with the comments from the case office that the propose development would have an unacceptable impact on highway safety contrary to CLP Policy 27.

Proposer: Councillor Mrs Swain  
Seconder: Councillor Wells

(v) **Unit 8, Nalders Court, Pydar Street (5)**  
(PA19/09750)

Unanimous approval recommended for Change of Use, subject to outdoor seating and tables not being allowed into the Court accessway or out onto the Leats area, in line with the comments from the Truro Conservation Area Advisory Committee.

Proposer: Councillor Pascoe  
Seconder: Councillor Mrs Swain

(vi) **26 Boscawen Street (6)**  
(PA19/10007)

Unanimous approval recommended for the installation of new refrigeration plant and redecoration of shop front subject to soundproofing measures being put in place to prevent the refrigeration plant from creating noise pollution, and to appropriate screening for the plant to improve the visual impact, as per the comments from the Truro Conservation Area Advisory Committee.

Members would welcome a separate advertisement application should the fascia board changes include signage.

(vii) **11 Treyew Road (7)**  
(PA19/10060)

Refusal recommended for the demolition of the existing building and proposal for a new 3 storey building on the grounds of it being an entirely inappropriate design that is inappropriate for the location.

Members are in favour of this type of development in principle, but the design should be aesthetically sympathetic to its unique location in Truro, incorporating local elements and materials.

Proposer: Councillor Vella

Councillor Ms Southcombe wished for her name to be recorded as having voted against the above application.

(viii) **79 Lemon Street (8)**  
(PA19/10352)

Refusal recommended, in line with the comments in the Case Officer's letter to the developer, citing comments made by the Conservation Officer that the proposal could not be supported from a historic environment perspective due to harm incurred to the building as a heritage asset and its setting. Members invite a new application that takes these aspects into account.

Proposer: Councillor Vella

As she had declared an interest in the above application, Councillor Mrs Carlyon wished for her name to be recorded as having abstained from voting.

(ix) **Boscawen Park, Malpas Road (9)**  
(PA19/10480)

Approval recommended, but Members would like to see a replanting plan please.

Proposer: Councillor Vella

Councillor Mrs Carlyon wished for her name to be recorded as having voted against the above recommendation.

(x) **12 Cathedral View, Kenwyn (10)**  
(PA19/10818)

Unanimous approval recommended subject to the removal of the cladding and the rendering on the chimney.

Proposer: Councillor Mrs Swain

Seconded: Councillor Pascoe.

## 290 **CONSULTATIONS**

(i) **Conservation Applications Report** (Appendix 3)

Members considered a report suggesting that due to the reformation of the Truro Conservation Area Advisory Committee (TCAAC), and the importance of their comments informing applications that the Planning Committee may consider at their meetings, revising the schedules of the Planning agenda may be prudent to ensure an efficient ongoing cycle of the Planning Committee. This would allow for ward members to comment in the month, and subsequently recommendations made (as per the current schedule 1) but also allow for applications within the Conservation Area to be revisited at the Planning Committee meetings should comments from the TCAAC merit further discussion.

Following discussion, it was proposed by Councillor Vella and unanimously

**RECOMMENDED** that the proposal, as outlined in Appendix 3, be adopted by the Planning Committee, subject to approval from Council.

(ii) **Home Office Consultation – Strengthening police powers to tackle unauthorized encampments**

Further to Minute 269 (i), page 158 (05.12.19, Planning Committee) and Minute 275 (iv), page 161 (09.12.19, Council), Members were asked to consider responding to a Home Office Consultation regarding strengthening police powers to tackle unauthorised encampments, as noted in a briefing from the National Association of Local Councils (NALC). The closing date for comments was 19 February 2020.

Further to discussion, including points about leaving vehicles on private land, concern over lack of suitable organised sites for travelers, as well as concern over the 'one size fits all' approach of the consultation document, it was proposed by Councillor Vella (Chairman) and

**RESOLVED** that, with permission of the Mayor, the above item be placed on the agenda for Council to consider on Monday 27 January 2020.

**291 LANGARTH STAKEHOLDER GROUP**

The Chairman reported the next stage of the consultation on Langarth was underway and there had been a display in the Pydar Street pop-up shop at the end of November. Members expressed ongoing concern regarding the Stadium, and the cumulative impact of the sites where proposals were being considered piecemeal, as well as concern over whether parish councils were being listened to. The Chairman commented that no development should take place until queries over the sewage had been answered satisfactorily.

The Committee Clerk confirmed there would be a second presentation, to which all Councillors would be invited, providing an update on the Langarth Masterplan. This would take place at 7:00pm on Monday 20 January 2020 in Truro Public Library.

**292 CHAIRMAN'S REPORT**

The Chairman had nothing to report as it had already been covered during the meeting.

**293 CORRESPONDENCE**

There was no correspondence to report as it had been circulated via email during the month.

The meeting closed at 9:05pm.

-----  
CHAIRMAN

# Schedule 1

## PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 2 JANUARY 2020

### SCHEDULE 1 – To Receive a Single Recommendation for the Entire Schedule at the Meeting.

*If Members of the Planning Committee wish for an application to be transferred to Schedule 2, please inform the Chairman and Clerk by Monday 23<sup>rd</sup> December at 5pm for it to be included on the agenda. Please use material planning considerations only.*

*If the recommendation already states “transfer to schedule 2” there is no need to comment further on this application until the meeting.*

Application Details	Proposal	Ward	Comments from Case Officers	Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman & Councillors
<b>PA19/04786</b> <b>Land at Tolgarrick</b> <b>Mr Simon Wagemakers</b>	Reserved matters application for appearance, landscaping, layout and scale following outline consent PA12/07283 for residential development of up to 320 dwellings, new highway access from Green Lane, landscaping, associated open space and infrastructure	<b>Redannick</b>	<b>Peter Bainbridge:</b>	Schedule 2
<b>PA19/10060</b> <b>11 Treyew Road</b> <b>Mr Paul Sanders,</b> <b>Saychette Ltd.</b>	Demolition of existing building and proposed new 3 storey building consisting of 10 No. 2 bed apartments	<b>Redannick</b>	<b>James Moseley:</b>	Schedule 2
<b>PA19/10346</b> <b>St Marys Church Of</b> <b>England School, Higher</b> <b>Trehaverne</b>	Works to trees subject to a tree preservation order as indicated in attached tree report	<b>Trehaverne</b>	<b>Camellia Bullingham:</b>	Approval recommended
<b>PA19/10007</b> <b>26 Boscawen Street</b> <b>The Co Op Group</b>	Proposal to install new refrigeration plant and redecorate shop front including fascia boards, window and door frames and rear elevation doors	<b>Tregolls</b>	<b>Camellia Bullingham:</b>	Schedule 2

# Schedule 1

<b>PA19/10555</b> <b>99 Bodmin Road</b> <b>Mr and Mrs Roger Maker</b>	Extension, alterations and replacement roof covering	<b>Boscawen</b>	<b>Niamh Ashworth:</b>	Approval recommended subject to render to match existing instead of timber cladding, to preserve the character of the house
<b>PA19/10352</b> <b>79 Lemon Street</b> <b>Mr Dewar</b>	Alterations to roof terrace access granted under PA18/11651	<b>Boscawen</b>	<b>Tim Marsh:</b>	Schedule 2
<b>PA19/10512</b> <b>Cemetery, Kenwyn</b> <b>Mr Martin Wright</b>	Various works to trees subject to a TPO	<b>Trehaverne</b>	<b>Camellia Bullingham:</b>	Approval recommended
<b>PA19/10271</b> <b>60 Tregolls Road</b> <b>Kingsley Developments (SW)</b>	Outline application with some matters reserved for erection of 8 detached properties (4 x 3 bed and 4 x 4 bed)	<b>Tregolls</b>	<b>Martin Woodley:</b>	Schedule 2
<b>PA19/10525</b> <b>Penavon, Kenwyn</b> <b>Mr Tomlinson and Miss Layton</b>	Proposed improved vehicular access, loft conversion and extension to garage	<b>Trehaverne</b>	<b>Camellia Bullingham:</b>	Approval recommended subject to no sustainable objections from neighbours.

# Schedule 1

<p><b>PA19/09402</b>  <b>Land adjacent to Lamorran, Old Falmouth Road</b>  <b>Mr S Musgreaves</b></p>	<p>The demolition of three existing buildings and replacement with a single storey sustainable dwelling</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p><b>James Moseley:</b> I did a positive pre-application on this site in relation to the principle of a new dwelling on the site, suggesting it would be previously developed land. At that stage there were no final designs. I would therefore suggest the primary issue here in my view is the visual impact, extent of the site, and any incursion into the countryside beyond the area which would be “previously developed land”. There are potential cumulative impacts in respect of highway safety given the expectation of access to Arch Hill to the north – I didn’t raise these at pre-application however, given it could be difficult to argue a single dwelling represents the tipping point where the highway impacts on that junction are no longer acceptable.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p><b>PA19/09403</b>  <b>Land To The North Of Lamorran Old Falmouth Road</b>  <b>Lamorran (Truro) Ltd.</b></p>	<p>Construction of two infill single storey dwellings</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p><b>Tim Marsh:</b> Although it appears to be otherwise acceptable, in light of the Highway Officer’s advice on and subsequent refusal last month of application PA19/07923 for 6 dwellings at Langweath Lodge a couple of hundred metres further to the north on Old Falmouth Road, in my opinion it is likely that the increase in the number of vehicles from this proposed development will be found to result in an unacceptable impact on highway safety contrary to CLP Policy 27.</p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>
<p><b>PA19/09750</b>  <b>Unit 8 Nalders Court, Pydar Street</b>  <b>Mr Tim Cooper, The Sullivan Trust</b></p>	<p>Change of use from A1 (retail) use to also allow alternative A3 (restaurant/café) and A4 (drinking establishment) uses</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p><b>Camellia Bullingham:</b></p>	<p>Schedule 2</p>

# Schedule 1

<b>PA19/10818</b> <b>12 Cathedral View,</b> <b>Kenwyn</b> <b>Mr Cooper</b>	Construction of a rear single storey extension with associated internal remodelling	<b>Trehaverne</b>	<b>Janice Taylor:</b> The application relates to the construction of a single storey rear extension and cladding to the main dwelling. The rear extension is subservient and appears to have limited impact on the street scene. The extension has a flat roof and the existing property has a high boundary fence, so it is unlikely that the proposal would cause significant overshadowing or overlooking to the neighbours.	Schedule 2
<b>PA19/10480</b> <b>Boscawen Park, Malpas</b> <b>Road</b> <b>Mr Barry Cooper</b>	Works to trees – Site A: Fell ten small to medium Monterey Pines; Site B: Fell two Corsican Pines and two Scots Pines	<b>Tregolls</b>	<b>Janice Taylor:</b>	Schedule 2

# Schedule 2

**PLANNING APPLICATIONS – FOR THE MEETING OF 2 JANUARY 2020**  
**SCHEDULE 2 – Applications to be considered at the Meeting.**

<b>Application Details</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>Ward</b>	<b>Comments from Case Officers</b>	<b>Recommendation from Chairman/ Vice-Chairman &amp; Councillors</b>
<b>(1) PA19/10271</b> <b>60 Tregolls Road</b> <b>Kingsley Development</b> <b>(SW)</b>	Outline application with some matters reserved for erection of 8 detached properties (4 x 3 bed and 4 x 4 bed)	<b>Tregolls</b>	<b>Martin Woodley:</b>	<b>Refusal</b>
<b>(2) PA19/04786</b> <b>Land at Tolgarrick</b> <b>Mr Simon Wagemakers</b>	Reserved matters application for appearance, landscaping, layout and scale following outline consent PA12/07283 for residential development of up to 320 dwellings, new highway access from Green Lane, landscaping, associated open space and infrastructure	<b>Redannick</b>	<b>Peter Bainbridge:</b>	<b>Refusal</b>
<b>(3) PA19/09402</b> <b>Land adjacent to</b> <b>Lamorran, Old Falmouth</b> <b>Road</b> <b>Mr S Musgreaves</b>	The demolition of three existing buildings and replacement with a single storey sustainable dwelling	<b>Redannick</b>	<b>James Moseley:</b> I did a positive pre-application on this site in relation to the principle of a new dwelling on the site, suggesting it would be previously developed land. At that stage there were no final designs. I would therefore suggest the primary issue here in my view is the visual impact, extent of the site, and any incursion into the countryside beyond the area which would be “previously developed land”. There are potential cumulative impacts in respect of highway safety given the expectation of access to Arch Hill to the north – I didn’t raise these at pre-application however, given it could be difficult to argue a single dwelling represents the tipping point where the highway impacts on that junction are no longer acceptable.	<b>Conditional Approval</b>

# Schedule 2

<p><b>(4) PA19/09403</b>  <b>Land To The North Of</b>  <b>Lamorran Old Falmouth</b>  <b>Road</b>  <b>Lamorran (Truro) Ltd.</b></p>	<p>Construction of two infill single storey dwellings</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p><b>Tim Marsh:</b> Although it appears to be otherwise acceptable, in light of the Highway Officer's advice on and subsequent refusal last month of application PA19/07923 for 6 dwellings at Langweath Lodge a couple of hundred metres further to the north on Old Falmouth Road, in my opinion it is likely that the increase in the number of vehicles from this proposed development will be found to result in an unacceptable impact on highway safety contrary to CLP Policy 27.</p>	<p><b>Refusal</b></p>
<p><b>(5) PA19/09750</b>  <b>Unit 8 Nalders Court,</b>  <b>Pydar Street</b>  <b>Mr Tim Cooper, The</b>  <b>Sullivan Trust</b></p>	<p>Change of use from A1 (retail) use to also allow alternative A3 (restaurant/café) and A4 (drinking establishment) uses</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p><b>Camellia Bullingham:</b></p>	<p><b>Conditional Approval</b></p>
<p><b>(6) PA19/10007</b>  <b>26 Boscawen Street</b>  <b>The Co Op Group</b></p>	<p>Proposal to install new refrigeration plant and redecorate shop front including fascia boards, window and door frames and rear elevation doors</p>	<p><b>Tregolls</b></p>	<p><b>Camellia Bullingham:</b></p>	<p><b>Conditional Approval</b></p>
<p><b>(7) PA19/10060</b>  <b>11 Treyew Road</b>  <b>Mr Paul Sanders,</b>  <b>Saychette Ltd.</b></p>	<p>Demolition of existing building and proposed new 3 storey building consisting of 10 No. 2 bed apartments</p>	<p><b>Redannick</b></p>	<p><b>James Moseley:</b></p>	<p><b>Refusal</b></p>
<p><b>(8) PA19/10352</b>  <b>79 Lemon Street</b>  <b>Mr Dewar</b></p>	<p>Alterations to roof terrace access granted under PA18/11651</p>	<p><b>Boscawen</b></p>	<p><b>Tim Marsh:</b></p>	<p><b>Refusal</b></p>
<p><b>(9) PA19/10480</b>  <b>Boscawen Park, Malpas</b>  <b>Road</b>  <b>Mr Barry Cooper</b></p>	<p>Works to trees – Site A: Fell ten small to medium Monterey Pines; Site B: Fell two Corsican Pines and two Scots Pines</p>	<p><b>Tregolls</b></p>	<p><b>Janice Taylor</b></p>	<p><b>Approval</b></p>

# Schedule 2

<p><b>(10) PA19/10818</b> <b>12 Cathedral View,</b> <b>Kenwyn</b> <b>Mr Cooper</b></p>	<p>Construction of a rear single storey extension with associated internal remodelling</p>	<p><b>Trehaverne</b></p>	<p><b>Janice Taylor:</b> The application relates to the construction of a single storey rear extension and cladding to the main dwelling. The rear extension is subservient and appears to have limited impact on the street scene. The extension has a flat roof and the existing property has a high boundary fence, so it is unlikely that the proposal would cause significant overshadowing or overlooking to the neighbours.</p>	<p><b>Conditional Approval</b></p>
--	--	--------------------------	--	------------------------------------

## Conservation Applications Report

### Background Summary

Further to the recent reformation of the Truro Conservation Area Advisory Committee (TCAAC), it has become apparent that it is beneficial that the comments made by the TCAAC inform the Planning Committee during consideration of Conservation Area applications at the Planning Committee meetings.

To maximise efficiency, the TCAAC meetings take place the same week as the Planning Committee meetings. However, conforming to legislation, the agenda for the Planning Committee meetings is issued prior to the meeting dates of the TCAAC.

To date, comments from the TCAAC have been read out at the Planning Committee meetings, and in the main, this has worked well. However, as became apparent at the December meeting of the Planning Committee, an application that had been placed on Schedule 1 for approval had been considered by the TCAAC two days prior, and important information that could potentially change the recommendation made by the Planning Committee had come to light.

In this instance, during the meeting the Chairman made the decision to move the application from Schedule 1 to Schedule 2, to be considered at the meeting. Planning procedures, that had been agreed following months of trial and error when Cornwall Council ceased issuing paper plans, specifies that as applications on Schedule 1 have been considered (via email) by the Planning Committee within the month, an 'en bloc' recommendation should be made at the meeting without further discussion. This, therefore, does not allow for applications to be moved to Schedule 2 at the meeting, and while the Chairman is able to exercise powers to do this, there is the potential for this to happen regularly with applications within the Conservation Area and therefore undermine the current processes of dealing with applications.

### Recommendation

Following consideration, it is recommended the Committee resolves to split Schedule 1 into two parts:

1. Schedule 1a) which will contain all applications not in the Conservation Area, which, as before, will be considered within the month prior to the Planning Committee meetings and recommendations for each application submitted with the agenda. At the meetings, Schedule 1a) will then be proposed 'en bloc' as before;
2. Schedule 1b) will contain all applications within the Conservation Area and all Listed Building applications. As above, recommendations will be considered within the month and a recommendation submitted with the agenda. However, these applications are subject to further consideration by the Planning Committee as felt necessary at their meetings, dependant on the comments made by the TCAAC that will be tabled/read out at each meeting.

Current Planning Committee procedures will be amended to reflect the above.